

**BOARD OF ASSESSORS MEETING**  
**Thursday, March 7, 2019 – 2:00pm - Rowe Town Hall**  
**Meeting Minutes**

---

1. **Call to Order:** Chair Williams called the meeting to order at 2:15pm.
2. **Present:** Rick Williams, Ellen Miller; Sandy Daviau, Assessors Clerk  
**Absent:** Herb Butzke
3. **MVExcise:** No activity.
4. **3ABC:** Reviewed the following submittals:
  - a) UURCC&CC (UU Rowe Camp & Conference Center): Reviewed 3ABC. Form PC and 990PF were not attached. They provided a copy of their IRS extension on their 990PF filing to July 15, 2019.
  - b) NEFF (NE Forestry Foundation): Received 3ABC with Form PC and 990PF.
5. **New Deeds/Transfers:** None
6. **Building Permits – Feb 2019:** Reviewed the following building permits:

Name	Address	Map/Lot	Permit #	Improvement	Value
Poehlein, Greg	61 Zoar Rd	410-015	R-19-0074	Install (2) mini-split heat pumps	\$ 15,750
Poehlein, Greg	61 Zoar Rd	410-015	E-19-0075	Electrical work for mini-splits	None given
Dionne, Loretta	21 Hazelton Rd	203-032	R-19-0077	Roofing/Siding/Windows	\$ 8,272

7. **Conference Call with Great River Hydro – 3:00-4:30pm:** The Assessors; GES: George (Skip) Sansoucy, and Matthew Sansoucy; Great River Hydro: Mark Cleverdon and their consultant Antreas Ghazarossian of Cost Containment Advisors, Greenwich CT, had a conference call concerning GES' FY19 appraisal of GRH hydroelectric facilities. Florida and Monroe Assessors were invited to participate but did not call in. Mark Cleverdon had sent a proposed discussion agenda including GRH's concerns with the GES appraisal as well as GRH's opinion of valuation. Skip Sansoucy explained the Assessor's January 30 request letter regarding information we need in order to appropriately consider their abatement applications. This discussion focused primarily on new growth/CWIP and historic original costs. GRH committed to work directly with GES to provide requested information. GRH had also provided a transcript from the recent ATB case *FirstLight Hydro Generating Co v. Board of Assessors of Montague & Gill* which was decided for the appellees, as the appellant "...did not meet its burden of proving that the subject property was overvalued for the fiscal year at issue...". The subject facility is FirstLight's Cabot Street Station located along the CT river. Their point in providing this document was to highlight two quotes in the report: one that the ATB favored the income approach, and 2) that the use of the sales approach didn't result in valid value. A closer look at the transcript shows that the appellant's valuation expert used two approaches: 1) replacement cost approach (RCA) and 2) direct capitalization and DCF (discounted cash flow). The ATB did not rely on their expert's RCA as "...evidence relating to costs must be supported by the testimony of a qualified engineer, architect, or construction manager. Ms. Buckley is none of those, nor was her report supported by the testimony of such a professional." The ATB also rejected her DCF approach, first because her projected income

stream was based on projections 20 and 45 years into the future (“...the sheer length of this period rendered Ms. Bulkley’s analysis speculative and unreliable.”); second, that the DCF analysis was an inappropriate methodology for determining the property’s fair cash value as there was ample evidence in the record that the operation of the subject property is impacted by forces beyond its control (including weather, government regulation and changes in energy technology and sources); and third, the ATB found her “...DCF analysis contained flaws that rendered it unreliable, including elements of circularity.” The ATB also rejected her direct-capitalization analysis as it incorporated many of the same elements they had already dismissed as flawed or unreliable.

Further from the ATB transcript: “Generally, real estate valuation experts, the Massachusetts courts, and this Board [ATB] rely upon three approaches to determine the fair cash value of property: income capitalization, sales comparison, and cost.” “In these appeals, the Board found and ruled that the sales comparison approach was not an appropriate methodology to use to estimate the value of the subject property because there were an insufficient number of sales of comparable property to provide a reliable base for comparison.” “The Board likewise declined to place weight on Ms Bulkley’s replacement-costs analysis.” The Board ruled that due to her lack of being qualified “...she was not competent to offer evidence of construction costs.”

GES’ report relies on all 3 methods (sales, income and cost). He stated that bottom line, the ATB ruled in favor of the appellees, and he didn’t see how the provided document impacted his appraisal of GRH.

**Note:** Skip reported that Joanne Graziano (DOR) stated that if there is any additional new growth going back to 2014, we could pick that up to increase our levy limit only. For recouping taxes on the new growth, we can only go back one year (to FY18).

**TO DO:** 1) Rick will email GRH requesting a time extension to June 30, 2019 for the Assessors to act on their abatement application. Current deadline is Monday, April 14. Mark Cleverdon stated he will respond in writing granting an extension. 2) Rick will email GRH’s FY10-FY17 & FY20 Forms of List to GES.

**8. CAI 2018 Map Updates:**

- a) MassGIS Standard Extract was sent to CAI on 3-1-19
- b) **TO DO:** Rick to review the 4 draft tax maps with revisions and report back to CAI before 3-21-19

**9. FY19 Budget Status:** OPS balance is \$291.19 less outstanding invoice pending (CAI 4Q19 map maintenance: \$225) = \$66. Wages balance is \$7,320.75.

**10. Executive Session:** At 5:32pm the Assessors voted by roll call vote (Rick – aye, Ellen – aye) to go into executive session under c.30A Sec. 21 (a), Item 7: *To comply with, or act under the authority of, any general or special law or federal grant-in-aid requirements (generally privacy)*, to consider a senior tax exemption application and approve executive session minutes, and to reconvene in open session.

**11. Reconvene in Open Session:** At 5:40pm the Board reconvened in Open Session.

**12. Regular Session Minutes:** Dec 12, Dec 19, Jan 18, Jan 30, Feb 20 & Mar 7 minutes were unanimously approved.

**13. Miscellaneous**

- a) Potential New AirBnB: Received copy of BOH letter to Mason/Whitaker re: their (Airbnb) rental of property at 32 Pelham Drive (Map 201 Lot 047) without proper permitting. Assessors will follow situation to determine if parcel should be taxed (either partially or fully) at commercial rate for FY20.

**14. Next Meeting:** TBD

**15. Adjournment:** Meeting adjourned at 5:55pm.

Respectfully submitted,  
Ellen B. Miller

Approved:

<u>FW Williams</u>	<u>3-7-2019</u>
Frederick N. Williams, Chair	Date
<u>Ellen B. Miller</u>	
Ellen B. Miller	

\_\_\_\_\_  
Herbert G. Butzke